

Minutes of Meeting

The third meeting of **National Council for Clinical Establishments** was held under the Chairmanship of Dr. Jagdish Prasad, DGHS, Govt. of India on 24-06-13.

Venue: Resource Centre, Room No.445 'A' Wing, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

The list of participants is annexed.

After the welcome and introduction of participants, the Chairman pointed out that there has been a delay on part of the Quality Council of India (QCI) and Indian Medical Association (IMA) to submit the report of survey of Clinical Establishments to the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare because of which, the latter is not able to progress with regard to development of the minimum standards etc. He emphasized that it is important that the Clinical Establishments Act (CEA) gets implemented in all metro cities which have a large number of various types of Clinical Establishments, which need to be regulated. He expressed concern regarding the CEA not covering the States/UTs like Delhi, West Bengal, and Maharashtra etc. which have a large number of private clinical establishments. However, steps are being taken to address this issue.

The Secretary of the Council, Dr. Arun K. Panda, Joint Secretary (Regulation), MOHFW, GOI, pointed out, States/UTs which have their own Acts are required to also repeal their Acts before the Clinical Establishments Act can be implemented in such States. The Chairman was of the view that State and UT should not find an excuse in the form of the schedule, for not implementing the Act.

Dr. K.K. Kalra, CEO NABH, informed that QCI is competent to develop any type of standards including regulatory standards. He pointed out that they are waiting for the survey report from IMA, which IMA is likely to submit soon. Dr. Arun K. Panda said that QCI should formally ask IMA to submit the survey report immediately, so that they are able to take into account the ground situation while drafting minimum standards.

Dr. Zainab Zaidi made a presentation on the data collected by IMA during the survey, on behalf of the IMA. The members of the Council desired that IMA should submit the detailed survey report, which may then be examined for utilizing the relevant findings. The IMA representative, Sh. Nitin N. Singh (Manager, IMA Headquarter) informed that IMA is in the process of finalizing the survey report and will be able to submit the report by 3rd of July, 2013. The QCI representative informed that they will be able to submit the draft minimum standards within 4 to 6 weeks of receiving the survey report from IMA.

There was a question raised by a member pointing out that many of the AYUSH doctors are prescribing allopathic medicines which is against the Supreme Court guidelines and same should be included in the minimum standards. The Chairman pointed out that wherever the AYUSH doctors are working under a National programme, they may prescribe the medicines given under that programme.

A presentation was made by Dr. Anil Kumar, CMO, Dte.GHS, regarding the action taken report on the minutes of the second meeting, which is summarized as under:

- i. The minutes of second meeting of National Council were confirmed.

- ii. The members were reminded of the timelines for publication of the national register and standards of proper health care as per the Act.
- iii. It was informed that after the enforcement of the Act, the States of Bihar, Jharkhand, Rajasthan and Uttar Pradesh have adopted the Act and are in the process of drafting/finalizing the state rules. Trainings are being conducted through NIC coordinators in the states. Online registration has started in the state of Himachal Pradesh. Budget is being provided through NRHM and other mechanisms to the States and UTs where the CEA 2010 is applicable and adopted.
- iv. The “Application Form for Provisional Registration” has been translated into Hindi and was shared with the participants and requested for inputs if any.
- v. Draft recommendations by Committee on Electronic Medical Records Standards developed and uploaded on the website of CEA.
- vi. The formats of qualitative detailed survey were shared with all Council members by QCI/IMA for their inputs.
- vii. As informed by QCI/IMA, IMA has completed both quantitative and qualitative survey in 11 States/UTs and made one presentation of the draft data. Report is yet to be submitted.
- viii. Inputs were provided to IMA by nodal officer Dr. Anil Kumar and Advisor Sh. Sunil Nandraj for analysis and finalization of Report.
- ix. First draft of minimum standards as developed by QCI was shared with council members and all the States/UTs where the Act is applicable.
- x. One Draft of range of rates of procedures and services, as may be charged by clinical establishments, has been prepared and shared with AIIMS New Delhi, for their suggestions.
- xi. Standard Treatment Guidelines on following areas have been developed and are in the process of finalization in consultation with the experts. The soft copies of the STGs were shared with the participants and members of council during the meeting.

- | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Cardiovascular | 2. Endocrinology |
| 3. ENT | 4. Gastro-Enterology |
| 4. General Surgery | 6. Interventional Radiology |
| 7. Laboratory Medicine | 8. Obstetrics and Gynaecology |
| 9. Organ Transplant | 10. Paediatrics |
| 11. Oncology | 12. Urology |
| 13. Nephrology | 14. G.I. Surgery |
| 15. Medicine Respiratory | 16. Medicine Non-Respiratory |
| 17. Critical Care | 18. Ophthalmology |
| 19. Neurology | 20. Orthopaedics |

It was also pointed out that STGs for AYUSH systems of medicines are also required to be formulated. There was a mixed opinion about the requirement of STGs for AYUSH. Most of the experts were of the opinion that it is feasible to formulate STGs for AYUSH systems and the same needs to be developed.

Regarding the need for increasing awareness about the Clinical Establishments Act, it was pointed out that Ministry of Health and FW may consider taking suitable action.

Prasanth K.S. from NHSRC shared that there is an expert committee formulated by MoHFW working on development of standards for public health institutions for provision of RMNCHA (Reproductive, Maternal, Newborn, Child and Adolescent Health) services. Dr. Arun Panda said that this report can be submitted to National Council and will be a resource material for the subcommittee working on development of minimum standards.

Presentation was made by Mr. Sunil Nandraj, Advisor CEA, regarding the proposed sub-committees and their terms of reference. The participants were informed that periodic communications have been sent to the State Governments and National council members to suggest names for the 5 sub committees proposed in the 2nd council meeting. The draft list of members of the sub-committees was circulated to the participants. The participants agreed with the names included in the draft subcommittees. The members of the National Council were keen to suggest a few more names and it was suggested that the same could be forwarded before July 1st 2013.

The following Terms of Reference (1-7) for the Sub-committees were agreed.

1. Standards may be developed phase wise: first phase may include where there is consensus.
2. The sub-committees shall include experts, stakeholders, representatives of State Govts. Private & public sectors, NGOs, professional bodies, academia and research institutions. There will be option to co-opt members & experts as per requirement of the Terms of Reference.
3. The Methodology and functioning of the sub-committees shall be as under:
 - To meet frequently and review the work being done and through emails
 - May commission some tasks of the work to experts identified who could be from outside the subcommittee under approval of the Chairman of the National Council.
 - Circulate draft outputs with various stakeholders for their inputs & suggestions.
 - Review & incorporate inputs from available surveys conducted by various stakeholders (including the QCI & IMA) & existing information, documents, literature, existing acts, rules, byelaws and material available.
4. The TA/DA to the subcommittee members shall be payable as applicable to the members of National Council for Clinical Establishments as per Clinical Establishments (Central Government) Rules 2012.
5. Budget shall be provided to subcommittees for holding workshops as per requirement including providing water, tea, snacks and lunch on the days of the workshops.
6. Chairperson would coordinate with the Clinical Establishments Act division of Dte.GHS / MOHFW for the above.

7. Specific tasks and timelines for each sub-committee shall be as under:

Sub-Committee on Categorization and Classification

To classify the clinical establishments into categories, with regard to the services & facilities offered, system of medicine offered, type of establishments, specialty, ownership, size, location among other aspects.

- Timeline: 1 month
- Outcome: A draft document providing the categorization & classification of clinical establishments.

Sub-Committee on Template for Developing Minimum Standards

Develop standard templates for the development of minimum standards for various categories of Clinical Establishments.

- Timeline: 1 month
- Outcome: Draft templates for the development of minimum standards for various categorization of clinical establishments

Sub-Committee for development of minimum standards

To develop draft minimum standards for various categories of Clinical Establishments of different systems of medicine.

- Timeline: 6 months
- Outcome: A draft document providing the minimum standards for the various categories of clinical establishments to be submitted to the National council.

Sub Committee on Information & Statistics to be collected from clinical establishments

To identify information and statistics to be collected especially with regard to services and facilities, outbreak of diseases, medico-legal cases, accidents, morbidity and mortality data, Government programmes among others & to develop template for the display of the rates charged for each type of service provided and facilities by the clinical establishment.

- Timeline: 2 months
- Outcome: The Information & Statistics to be collected from various categories of clinical establishments

Sub-Committee for defining range of rates of procedures & services

To define the range of rates of procedures and services provided by the clinical establishments. The sub-committee would review and examine the existing rates being charged under the various schemes and reimbursed by insurance companies.

- Timeline: 6 months
- Outcome: Suggested range of rates of procedures and services

In summary, after discussions and deliberations, following action points were recommended:

1. National Council members were requested to suggest names for each subcommittee by 1st of July, 2013. The DGHS, the Chairperson of the National Council was requested to finalize suitable names based on their qualifications, affiliation, experience and expertise in the proposed sub committees.
2. QCI should formally ask IMA to submit the survey report immediately and after receiving the Report from IMA, QCI should formulate the draft minimum standards at the earliest in consultation with the experts and other professional medical associations, taking into account the findings of the Survey Report.
3. The DGHS shall take a meeting of both IMA and QCI representative on 8th July, 2013 or later at a convenient date to review the submission of Survey Report and progress made.
4. There shall be one subcommittee for development of minimum standards of AYUSH. This subcommittee shall have subgroups to develop minimum standards for respective systems under AYUSH. Each subgroup shall have experts from the respective systems under AYUSH namely Ayurveda, Unani, Siddha, Homoeopathy, Yoga, Naturopathy and Sowa Rigpa.
5. The subcommittee of AYUSH may also take action for formulating Standard Treatment Guidelines for the respective system under AYUSH, wherever feasible.
6. Ministry of Health and Family Welfare may consider taking action for spreading awareness about the Clinical Establishments Act and may also consider constituting a committee for development of IEC material.
7. Dte.GHS would complete the task of vetting the Standard Treatment Guidelines (STGs) expeditiously, to be uploaded on the website.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to and from the Chair.

List of Participants in 3rd Meeting of ‘National Council for Clinical Establishment’ held on 24-06-2013 under chairmanship of DGHS

S.No.	Name with Designation and Address	Email
1.	Dr. Jagdish Prasad, DGHS (Chairman)	dghs@nic.in
2.	DR. A.K. Panda, Joint Secretary, MOHFW	arunpanda84@gmail.com
3.	Dr. Vanithamuralikumar, Vice President (Ayurveda), CCIM, 7/2, AnthoniyarKoil Street, Opposite to Bus Stand, Dharkhast, Chennai-44	drvmkmd@gmail.com
4.	Dr. Rashidullah Khan, Vice President, Unani, CCIM, D-176, Abul Fazal, Jamia Nagar, New Delhi-110025	Rasid.ccrum@gmail.com
5.	Dr. Stanley Jones, Vice President (Siddha) , CCIM	drvstanleyjones@gmail.com
6.	Dr. D.C. Katoch, Joint Advisor (Ay), Dept. of AYUSH	dckatoch@rediffmail.com
7.	Dr. K.K. Kalra, CEO-NABH, QCI	Ceo@nabh.co
8.	Dr. Girdhar J. Gyani, Director General, Association of Healthcare Providers (India), C/o IMA Building, New Delhi-110002	gyani@ahpi.in
9.	Sh. Nitin N. Singh, General Manager, IMA (Headquarter) IMA House, IP Marg, New Delhi.	nnsingh@ima-india.org
10.	Dr. K Reddemma, Senior Prof., Dept. Of Nursing, NIMHANS, Bangalore	reddemma@rediffmail.com
11.	Sh. Prasanth KS, Consultant, NHSRC, New Delhi	prasanth.mph@gmail.com
12.	Dr. Tarsem Chand, Director, MOHFW	tarsemchand@nic.in
13.	Sh. Vishwajeet V. Ringe, Senior Technical Director, NIC, Nirman Bhawan	ringe@nic.in
14.	Dr. Ramjee Singh, President, Central Council of Homoeopathy, Ashok Nagar, Road No. 4, Kankar Bagh, Patna, Bihar	dr_ramjeesingh@rediffmail.com
15.	Dr. Bamin Tada, Adviser Health, North Eastern Council, Shillong, NEC Secretariat, Nangsil Hills, Shillong-793003 NE India	putnaghee@yahoo.com
16.	Dr. B.S. Nagaonkar, Deputy Director (Hospitals) Maharashtra	nagaonkar@gmail.com jtdirectormed@gmail.com
17.	Dr. T.K. Ravi, Principal, College of Pharmacy, Shri Rama Krishna Hospital Campus, Coimbatore (Pharmacy Council of India)	pha_sripms@yahoo.com
18.	Dr. Mira Shiva, Consumer Education Research Centre	mirashiva@gmail.com
19.	Sh. Ashim Sanyal, Voice Society, O-45, Lajpat Nagar II, Ring Road, New Delhi	coo@consumer-voice.org
20.	Sh. Arun Choudhary, US, MOHFW	
21.	Sh. Sunil Nandraj, Advisor, Clinical Establishments Act, MOHFW	sunil.nandraj@gmail.com
22.	Dr. Zainab Zaidi, Asstt. Director, NABH, Quality Council of India	zainab_zaidi@rediffmail.com, zainab@nabh.co
23.	Sh. Bhuvnesh Mishra, NIC	mishra.b@nic.in
24.	Sh. Prashant Shukla, 258-Okhla-II SIFY c/o NIC	Prashant.shukla@sifycorp.com
25.	Dr. Anil Kumar, Chief Medical Officer, Dte. G.H.S	dr.anilkumar@nic.in