

Z.28015/91/2011-H/MH II/Vol II
Government of India
Directorate General of Health Services
National Council Secretariat

Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi

Dated: 17th October 2025

Minutes of Meeting

Subject: Minutes of 16th Meeting of National Council held under the Chairpersonship of Dr. Sunita Sharma, Director General of Health Services, held on 9th September 2025

The undersigned is directed to forward herewith the Minutes of the 16th Meeting of National Council on above subject held under the Chairpersonship of Dr. Sunita Sharma, Director General of Health Services, on 9th September 2025, 10:00 AM – 01:00 PM at 445-A, Resource Center, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi.

This issues with the approval of competent authority.

Dr. Ravi Kumar

डॉ. रवि कुमार / Dr. Ravi Kumar
Deputy Director General
Head and Nodal Officer
उप महानिदेशक
Clinical Establishment Division
स्वास्थ्य सेवा महानिदेशालय
Directorate General of Health Services
भारत सरकार / Govt. of India
निर्माण भवन, नई दिल्ली / New Delhi
Ninnan Bhawan, New Delhi-110011

Enclosure: Minutes of 16th Meeting of National Council held on 9th September 2025

Copy To,

All the Participants

Copy for information to

1. PSO to DGHS, Dte. GHS, Nirman Bhawan
2. PPS to JS, MOHFW, Nirman Bhawan

Minutes of 16th Meeting of National Council for Clinical Establishments (NCCE)

Minutes of 16th Meeting of National Council for Clinical Establishments (NCCE) held under the chairpersonship of Dr. Sunita Sharma, Director General of Health Services, on 9th September 2025, 10:00 AM – 01:00 PM at 445-A, Resource Center, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi

The list of participants is at Annexure-I.

Dr Ravi Kumar, Deputy Director General, & Nodal Officer, National Council Secretariat (NCS) welcomed the Chairperson and the attendees to the 16th Meeting of the National Council for Clinical Establishments (NCCE). He briefly outlined the purpose of the Clinical Establishments Act, 2010 and its significance in setting minimum standards for clinical establishments.

Dr. Sunita Sharma, Director General of Health services and Chairperson of meeting, emphasized the importance of the 16th meeting in addressing key issues related to the Clinical Establishments (CE) Act, 2010 particularly the presentation of minimum standards vetted by the Department of Legal Affairs (DOLA) and seeking approvals for certain essential standards as per Hon'ble Court directions. DGHS also informed of the Supreme Court's order (14.08.2025) on rule 9 (ii) of CE Rules, 2012 regarding range of rate, requiring NCCE's views before the Court in November 2025.

Dr. R. P. Joshi, Addl. DGHS, underlined the diverse composition of NCCE, including statutory councils and stakeholders, and noted the Supreme Court's acknowledgment of NCCE's role.

It was informed that several minimum standards had already been approved, while some vetted by DOLA with modifications would be presented to NCCE before notification in the Gazette of India.

Mr. Ghulam Mustafa, Joint Secretary, MoHFW & Secretary of NCCE, emphasized obtaining competent authority approval for notification.

Agenda Point I: Dr Ravi Kumar, Deputy Director General, & Nodal Officer, NCS made a brief presentation on the progress of implementation of the CEA 2010. It was informed that:

Between January and August 2025, various initiatives were undertaken for CE Act implementation, including online meetings with Sikkim and Lakshadweep, physical advocacy-cum-review training meeting in Telangana and Bihar, development of training modules on the iGOT Karmayogi platform, and An Artificial Intelligence-based training program on the Clinical Establishments Act was also demonstrated.

Dr. A. Raghu, Deputy Director General, DteGHS, suggested to include AYUSH subject experts in State-level trainings to ensure implementation across Ayurveda, Yoga & Naturopathy, Unani, Siddha, and Homeopathy sectors. It was recommended that orientation and training sessions be conducted for clinical establishment users, with the involvement of practitioner associations through direct interactions.

It was further suggested to develop a detailed PowerPoint presentation covering the overview, scope, applicability, and implementation mechanism of the CE Act for practitioners. It was recommended that the Patient Charter Rights be prominently displayed in all Ayushman Bharat–empanelled hospitals to enhance patient awareness regarding their rights and grievance redressal mechanisms. It was also suggested that national-level meetings be held more frequently to ensure wider participation, regular review, and timely resolution of issues.

(Action- National Council Secretariat)

Agenda Point II: Discussion on matters related to CE Act including legal matters.

1. Rule 9(ii) of the Clinical Establishments Act

- Dr. Umesh Suranagi, Professor, DteGHS, informed that Rule 9(ii) of the Clinical Establishments Act requires rates for procedures and services be charged within a range determined and notified by the Central Government in consultation with the State Governments.
- He further noted that Rule 9(i) of the Clinical Establishments Rules, which requires every clinical establishment to prominently display details of charges and facilities at a conspicuous place, has been duly implemented and is being followed.
- It was apprised that there are currently three cases supporting the implementation of Rule 9(ii) and five cases challenging it, on grounds of being unconstitutional—citing violations of Articles 14, 19(1)(g), and 21 of the Constitution—and on the basis of being ultra vires to the CEA, 2010.
- The Council was informed that NCCE has drafted a costing template and a list of procedures for the States, which has been shared multiple times to assist in determining a range of rates. Two multilateral consultations were also held with all States, including those having their own Acts, as per Court directions. States raised several concerns regarding feasibility and implications, citing factors such as geographical variations, local conditions, intangible human resource costs, and other related challenges, which have made the implementation of Rule 9(ii) difficult.
- It was further informed that as per the recent Court order dated 14.08.2025, the final hearing is scheduled for 18th November 2025, and the Court has sought the views of NCCE. Accordingly, a government counsel will be appointed to represent NCCE in this matter.
- As per the court directives, the writ petition will be shared with all NCCE members for their review, and members have been requested to provide their views/comments through email. Members requested that a summary of the writ petition be circulated for better understanding.

(Action- National Council Secretariat)

2. Minimum standards – Hair transplant centres

- It was apprised that the Hon'ble Delhi High Court, directed MoHFW to frame national-level medical protocols for hair transplantation centres due to a death due to faulty hair transplant procedure by a technician. In compliance with the court directives, Minimum Standards for Hair Transplant Centres, were finalized. The Hon'ble Delhi High Court, disposed of the case with directions to MoHFW for implementation of the said standards.
- Meanwhile, IAAPS submitted a representation objecting to inclusion of MDS (Maxillofacial Surgeons) for performing hair transplant procedures, and IADVL (Tamil Nadu Branch) has filed writ petitions before the Madras High Court (W.P. No. 36164/2024) challenging the Dental Council of India guidelines dated 06.12.2022 which permit MDS (Oral & Maxillofacial Surgery) to perform hair transplants.
- The DCI representative clarified that MDS (OMFS) were included as scalp procedures fall under their purview, and the provision was intended only for hospital-based setups with anaesthesiology support.
- Since the Minimum Standards are already drafted under NCCE and the matter being sub judice, The NCCE agreed to wait until the final judgement arrives.

(Action- National Council Secretariat)

3. Minimum standards- sample collection and sample transport policy

- In compliance with the Hon'ble Delhi High Court's directions, the Ministry was required to draft and notify Minimum Standards for sample collection centres, sample collection, and sample transport. The Minimum Standards for Sample Collection Centres, as approved by the NCCE, are at an advanced stage of Gazette notification, having been legally vetted by the Department of Legal Affairs.
- Further, it was apprised that separate sub-committees of experts in pathology, biochemistry, haematology, and microbiology formulated the draft Minimum Standards for sample collection and transport. These drafts were technically finalized and duly vetted by the respective subject experts.
- The draft was then placed before the NCCE in the meeting, deliberated upon, and approved by the Council for further process of gazette notification.

(Action- National Council Secretariat and Medical service section)

4. Regarding exemption from CE Acts 2010 requests of hospitals less than 50 beds:

- Level 1A and 1B hospitals already have minimum standards guidelines. Dr. R.P. Joshi (Addl. DG) raised a query regarding the practical constraints in implementing these standards and suggested detailed discussions with stakeholders. Dr. Ravi Kumar (DDG) informed that a representation from the IMA President had been received through MoHFW, to which a reply has already been sent to the MS Section. Dr. Umesh Surangi further cautioned that making the standards too lenient may compromise healthcare quality.
- The existing Minimum Standards for clinics or polyclinics (consultation, dispensary, short stay) which have been vetted by DOLA are already at advance stage of gazette notification which will cover substantial portion of small hospitals, easing their compliance and facilitation.
- Dr. R.P. Joshi (Addl. DG) advised to hold a stakeholder consultation to understand the specific difficulties faced by States and to deliberate on possible solutions.

(Action- National Council Secretariat)

Agenda Point III: Update on minimum standards

- a) It was informed that eight Minimum Standards—Clinic/Polyclinic (only consultation), Clinic/Polyclinic with dispensary, Clinic/Polyclinic with diagnostic support, Clinic/Polyclinic with observation, Dietary Counselling Centres/Dietetics, Sample Collection Centres, Mobile Clinic (only consultation), and Mobile Dental Van—already approved by the NCCE, have been vetted by the Department of Legal Affairs (DoLA) and are in the final stages of notification.

The modifications suggested by DoLA were presented before the NCCE, deliberated upon, and approved by the Council. It was further suggested to proceed with the final steps for Gazette notification.

It was suggested that, while framing record-keeping guidelines, due consideration must be given to maintaining privacy and confidentiality of data.

(Action- National Council Secretariat and Medical service section)

- b) The following Minimum Standards, which had been presented in earlier NCCE meetings with certain modifications, were again placed before the Council and approved: Mortuary, Ophthalmology Day Care Centres, Cosmetology, and AYUSH (Clinic/Polyclinic—only consultation; AYUSH dispensary; AYUSH therapy/day care centre; and AYUSH hospitals with capacities of up to 10 beds, 11–30 beds, 31–50 beds, 51–100 beds, and more than 100 beds).

The NCCE was of the view that these Minimum Standards may be moved forward for the next steps of legal vetting and Gazette notification.

(Action- National Council Secretariat and Medical service section)

- c) It was informed that the Charter of Doctors' Rights and Responsibilities has been formulated by subject experts in a Sub-Committee to be issued as an advisory. However, it was suggested that the draft may be shared with the National Medical Commission (NMC) for adoption, along with all other NCCE members. The NMC representative suggested it could form part of the Code of Ethics and requested it be sent to them for consideration.

It was noted that the MCI Code of Conduct (2002) covers prescription-related responsibilities but does not provide for rights, whereas the proposed Charter is an advisory document.

The NCISM representative informed that board of ethics and registration, regulation under the ISM Council already contains provisions on the Rights and Privileges of the Practitioner. The NCIM representatives also mentioned to send them the charter of doctors prepared to them as well.

(Action- National Council Secretariat)

- d) It was clarified that the Clinical Establishments Act does not override the rights of practitioners, as professional practice is regulated by the respective Commissions. The CE Act pertains specifically to facilities and services, and not to professional conduct.

Dr. R.P. Joshi (Addl. DG) thanked members for their inputs and assured that concerns will be addressed within the rules. Dr. Ravi Kumar (DDG & Nodal Officer, NCS) concluded the meeting.

Annexure- I**List of Attendees**

S.No	Name with Designation	Organisation	Email
1	Dr Mira Shiva	Representative Consumer Education and Research Centre	drmirashiva1978@gmail.com
2	Prof Sriram Khanna Sr Vice Chairman and Managing trustee	VOICE Society, New Delhi	sriramkhanna@yahoo.co.in
3	Dr A.Raghu, DDG(Ayush) Advisor	Ministry of AYUSH, Dte.GHS	a.raghu@nic.in
4	Prof (Dr) Mohammad Mazahir Alam, President, Board of Unani, Siddha & Sowa-Rigpa	Member, National Commission for Indian System of Medicine	mazahiralam532@gmail.com
5	Vaidya Santosh Nevpurkar	Member, National Commission for Indian System of Medicine	nevpurkarsantosh@gmail.com
6	Dr. Anand Kumar Chaturvedi, President	National Commission for Homeopathy	dranandazh@gmail.com
7	Dr. Rajnesh Attam, Hony. Joint. Secretary	Indian Medical Association	rajneshattam@gmail.com
8	Dr. S.M.Kudari, President, Board of Ayurveda	Member, National Commission for Indian System of Medicine	president.boa@ncismindia.org
9	Prof (Dr) Narayan S. Jadhav, President, Medical Assessment and Rating Board	Member, National Commission for Indian System of Medicine	president.marbism@ncismindia.org
10	Ms.Deepti Mohan	NABH, Quality Council of India	deepti@nabh.co
11	Dr. Sandeep Datta, Hony. Assistant Secretary, IMA	Indian Medical Association	dattasandeep23@gmail.com
12	Dr. Rajiv Bhardwaj, Admin.Officer	National Commission for Indian System of Medicine	rajivbhardwaj8050@gmail.com
Online Participants			
13	Ms Nagavarshini M, Scientist C	Bureau of Indian Standards (BIS)	nagavarshini@bis.gov.in

14	Mr. Santosh Kumar Katharia	Dental Council of India	secy-dci@nic.in
15	Dr Abhishek Singh Joint Secretary	Dental Council of India	
16	Dr. Mukesh Nagar	National Medical Commission	drmukeshnagar@vmmc-sjh.nic.in
17	Mr. Sukh Lal Meena, Director	National Medical Commission	meena.sukh@nic.in
18	Shri Anil Mittal	Pharmacy council of India	registrar@pci.nic.in
19	Ms. Kanika Technical Officer	Pharmacy Council of India	registrar@pci.nic.in